Assessing Ethical Infrastructure in Your Law Firm: A Practical Guide

Canadian Bar Association Ethics and Professional Responsibility Committee

2013-2014 CBA Ethics and Professional Responsibility Committee Malcolm M. Mercer, Chair Julia E. Cornish Lisa C. Fong Anthony J. Kavanagh Monika M.L. Zauhar

Research Director Amy Salyzyn, J.S.D. candidate (Yale)

Staff Liaison: Sarah MacKenzie, CBA Staff Lawyer, Law Reform





INFLUENCE. LEADERSHIP. PROTECTION.

INTRODUCTION

The Canadian Bar Association's Ethics and Professional Responsibility Committee has undertaken this project to encourage better "ethical infrastructure" in legal practice. The project's goal is to assist lawyers and law firms by providing practical guidance on law firm structures, policies and procedures to ensure that ethical duties to clients, third parties and the public are fulfilled. To this end, the Committee has prepared an Ethical Practices Self-Evaluation Tool to assist Canadian law firms and lawyers to systematically examine the ethical infrastructure that supports their legal practices. The Ethical Practices Self-Evaluation Tool can be found at Appendix A. Using a tool of this type is not only beneficial as a means of increasing professionalism but can also yield tangible risk management returns by reducing firm exposure to disciplinary complaints and malpractice actions.

WHAT IS "ETHICAL INFRASTRUCTURE"?

Use of the term "ethical infrastructure" in the law firm context can be traced to Ted Schneyer, a law professor at the University of Arizona.¹ Schneyer defines "ethical infrastructure" as:

Consist[ing] of the policies, procedures, systems, and structures—in short, the "measures" that ensure lawyers in their firm comply with their ethical duties and that nonlawyers associated with the firm behave in a manner consistent with the lawyers' duties.²

Aspects of a firm's ethical infrastructure might include, for example: centralized procedures for checking conflicts of interest; billing protocols; the use of template retainer letters; or the designation of an in-house ethics counsel. It is meant to be a broad, general term. Also, the term "ethical infrastructure" is best understood as including not only formal policies and procedures but also more informal aspects of workplace culture and practices that impact lawyers' ability to identify and resolve ethical issues.³ Even if appropriate formal policies and procedures are in place, those measures may prove ineffective if the broader organizational culture does not facilitate and foster ethical compliance.⁴

WHY TAKE AN INTEREST IN ETHICAL INFRASTRUCTURE?

Increased interest in law firm ethical infrastructure over the past several decades has been motivated, in large part, by perceived shortcomings inherent in conventional approaches which focus on disciplining individual lawyers "after the fact" rather than encouraging best practices by firms to avoid ethical breaches in the first place. Specific regulatory developments, particularly in Australia, have also contributed to a growing interest in ethical infrastructure.

¹ Ted Schneyer, "Professional Discipline for Law Firms?" (1991) 77 Cornell Law Review 1.

² Ted Schneyer, "On Further Reflection: How 'Professional Self-Regulation' Should Promote Compliance with Broad Ethical Duties of Law Firm Management" (2011) 53 Arizona Law Review 577 at 585.

³ See, for example, Christine Parker et al, "The Ethical Infrastructure of Legal Practice in Larger Law Firms: Values, Policy and Behaviour" (2008) 31(1) UNSW Law Journal 158 at 159-160 and Christine Parker and Lyn Aitken, "The Queensland 'Workplace Culture Check': Learning from Reflection on Ethics inside Law Firms" (2011) 24 Georgetown Journal of Legal Ethics 399.

⁴ See, for example, discussions in Milton C. Regan, "Moral Intuitions and Organizational Culture" (2007) 51 Saint Louis University Law Journal 941 and Christine Parker et al, "The Ethical Infrastructure of Legal Practice in Larger Law Firms: Values, Policy and Behaviour" (2008) 31(1) UNSW Law Journal 158.

Conventional lawyer regulation regimes tend to deal with "after the fact" complaints against individual lawyers about alleged breaches of codes of professional conduct. Given that many lawyers practice together in firms, this focus on individual conduct fails to address much of what happens at a law firm that either encourages or deters ethical conduct. Recognition of this disconnect has resulted in a move towards examining ethical behaviour at law firms at an institutional level, in addition to an individual level. Although directly regulating law firms is one way to do this,⁵ interest has also grown in approaches that focus on "education towards compliance"⁶ and "proactive, management-based regulation."⁷ This more preventive, educative model not only approaches the question of ethical compliance from an institutional perspective but also compensates for other limitations of the conventional complaints-based regulatory model: in particular, its tendency to be highly selective in its application, focus exclusively on minimum standards and be primarily reactive.⁸

The underlying idea is that regulators should look to implement more robust proactive measures to assist firms in developing effective ethical infrastructure. Regulatory developments in New South Wales (NSW) in Australia provide an excellent example of the positive effects of this proactive model of "education towards compliance". A number of years ago, the state passed legislation which permitted law firms to incorporate without restriction on non-lawyer ownership and, if they wish, to provide legal services in conjunction with non-lawyers. The legislative changes also included a requirement that incorporated legal practices implement "appropriate management systems". To provide guidance, the regulator and other stakeholders worked together to define criteria that would enable practitioners to evaluate whether their firms had appropriate management systems. A "self-assessment form" was developed with which incorporated legal practices could evaluate their compliance with ten stated objectives. The self-assessment form used in NSW can be found here. Other Australian states have now also passed legislation providing for self-assessment processes.⁹

The results of preliminary studies suggest that the NSW self-assessment process is highly effective. Among other things, these studies found:

- On average, the complaint rate for each incorporated legal practice after self-assessment was one third the complaint rate of the same practices before self-assessment, and also about one third the complaint rate of firms that were not incorporated and thus never required to self-assess.¹⁰
- A vast majority of firms reported that they revised firm policies or procedures relating to the delivery of legal services and many reported that they adopted new procedures.¹¹
- A majority of firms reported that the self-assessment process was a learning exercise that helped them improve client service.¹²

⁵ Adam Dodek, "Regulating Law Firms in Canada" (2001) 90 Canadian Bar Review 383.

⁶ The phrase "education towards compliance" has been used by the regulator in the Australian state of New South Wales. For a discussion, see, for example, Christine Parker, Tahlia Gordon, and Steve Mark "Regulating Law Firms Ethics Management: An Empirical Assessment of an Innovation in Regulation of the Legal Profession in New South Wales" (2010) 37(3) Journal of Law and Society 446 at 468.

⁷ The term "proactive, management-based regulation" or "PMBR" is another term coined by Professor Schneyer, who defines it as consisting of "firm-designated lawyer-managers and proactive collaboration between firms and regulators as a complement to enforcing those duties in adversarial disciplinary proceedings." (Schneyer, *supra* note 2).

⁸ John Britton and Scott McLean, "Incorporated Legal Practices: Dragging the Regulation of the Legal Profession into the Modern Era" (2008) 11 Legal Ethics 241 at 242-243.

⁹ Susan Fortney and Tahlia Gordon, "Adopting Law Firm Management Systems to Survive and Thrive: A Study of the Australian Approach to Management-Based Regulation" (forthcoming). For a discussion of practices in the state of Queensland, see Legal Services Commission, "Self-assessment audits" online: http://www.lsc.qld.gov.au/compliance/incorporated-legal-practices/compliance-audits/self-assessment-audits.

¹⁰ Christine Parker, Tahlia Gordon, and Steve Mark "Regulating Law Firms Ethics Management: An Empirical Assessment of an Innovation in Regulation of the Legal Profession in New South Wales" (2010) 37(3) Journal of Law and Society 446 at 493.

¹¹ Susan Fortney and Tahlia Gordon, "Adopting Law Firm Management Systems to Survive and Thrive: A Study of the Australian Approach to Management-Based Regulation" (forthcoming).

¹² Ibid.

Although it is regulators of lawyers who are guiding the self-assessment processes in Australia, it has been said that the "main purpose" of this type of model is not regulatory correction but rather "to get firms to go through the process as a learning exercise to improve their own systems."¹³

Interestingly, one study of the NSW self-assessment process found that it made little difference to complaint rates what rating the firms gave themselves in the various categories. This finding led the authors of the study to conclude "[i]f self-assessment makes a difference, it must be the learning and changes prompted by the process of self-assessment that does so, not the actual (self-assessed) level of implementation or management systems."¹⁴ As Christine Parker and Lyn Aitken explain:

[I]t is probably the process of a firm attending to the need to consider what sort of ethical infrastructure it already has (seeking to selfcritically describe its own ethical infrastructure), and then deciding for itself what formal ethical supports it needs (taking responsibility for normatively defining ethical infrastructure for itself) that is important in enabling ethical practice.¹⁵

With a view to assisting Canadian law firms to think about and examine their ethical infrastructure in a systematic way, the CBA Ethics and Professional Responsibility Committee has developed the Ethical Practices Self-Evaluation Tool in Appendix A. For those interested in learning more about ethical infrastructure, a reading list is provided at Appendix B.

THE CBA SELF-EVALUATION TOOL

The CBA Ethical Practices Self-Evaluation Tool in Appendix A focuses on ten potential areas or aspects of law firm ethical infrastructure, grouped under three relationship categories:

I. Relationship to Clients

- 1. Competence
- 2. Client Communication
- *3. Confidentiality*
- 4. Conflicts
- 5. Preservation of Clients' Property/Trust Accounting/File Transfers
- 6. Fees and disbursements

¹³ Christine Parker, Tahlia Gordon, and Steve Mark "Regulating Law Firms Ethics Management: An Empirical Assessment of an Innovation in Regulation of the Legal Profession in New South Wales" (2010) 37(3) Journal of Law and Society 446 at 494.

¹⁴ *Ibid.* at 493.

¹⁵ Christine Parker and Lyn Aitken, "The Queensland 'Workplace Culture Check': Learning from Reflection on Ethics Inside Law Firms" (2011) 24 Georgetown Journal of Legal Ethics 399 at 406.

II. Relationship to Firm Members

- 7. Hiring
- 8. Supervision/Retention/Lawyer and Staff Wellbeing

III. Relationship to Regulator, Third-Parties, and the Public Generally

- 9. Rule of Law and the Administration of Justice
- 10. Access to Justice

In the CBA Ethical Practices Self-Evaluation Tool, each of the ten headings above are connected with: (1) an objective; (2) possible questions to ask in assessing compliance with this objective; (3) potential systems and practices to ensure the objective is met; and (4) examples of resources available.

The ten headings in the Self-Evaluation Tool were chosen following a review of professional codes of conduct and statistics on top areas of client complaints and malpractice claims. Thought was also given to how the Self-Evaluation Tool might include aspects of ethical infrastructure that reach beyond client-service issues and compliance with rules set out in codes of conduct. To this end, for example, firm practices are covered with regard to access to justice, and diversity and equality in hiring practices.

Although the ten chosen areas capture prominent concerns and risks in relation to ethical infrastructure in Canadian law firms, there is no particular "magic" to these areas. More areas could easily be added and a number of the areas deal with overlapping issues. Moreover, an instrument of this type will need to evolve with developments in the regulatory and practice environments.

The Committee did, however, consciously develops a relatively short list of topics and designed the Self-Evaluation Tool in a manner that engaged with these topics at a relatively general or "high" level. The aim in doing so was to make the tool manageable and flexible across practice contexts. In taking this approach, the Committee was inspired by the Australian model, which aims to "encourage practitioners and firms to take responsibility for developing their own personal ethical judgments, rather than just seeing compliance with professional conduct rules and management systems as the sum total of ethics."¹⁶ The goal of the Self-Evaluation Tool is not to be prescriptive but rather to encourage exploration and discussion of firm practices. As such, the questions, practices and resources listed should be approached as suggestions rather than mandates. Lawyers are also encouraged to think creatively about what additional content could be appropriately and helpfully added to the Self-Evaluation Tool. Individual firms will have unique circumstances and needs to which lawyers should be attentive.

Finally, given that the Canadian legal profession is regulated in each province and territory, lawyers using the Self-Evaluation Tool should be cognizant of the unique rules that may apply in their jurisdictions and bear this in mind when reviewing listed resources developed in other provinces and territories. The resources listed should also be evaluated for their currency – ethical obligations under which Canadian lawyers operate evolve

¹⁶ Christine Parker, Tahlia Gordon, and Steve Mark "Regulating Law Firms Ethics Management: An Empirical Assessment of an Innovation in Regulation of the Legal Profession in New South Wales" (2010) 37(3) Journal of Law and Society 446 at 473.

and this evolution may result in some of the resources being out-of-date. The content listed under the heading "Resources" is a selection of material located on publically-accessible websites; additional resources exist and, in some cases, websites may have additional helpful content that is available to members only. The particular website on which content can be located is identified in each case, but there may be additional author information available on the linked documents themselves. If lawyers have any concern about the legal or regulatory applicability of a particular practice or resource, they should consult the relevant law society or seek independent legal advice. Nothing in the Self-Evaluation Tool should be interpreted as stating a standard of care.

I. RELATIONSHIP TO CLIENTS

1. <u>Competence</u>

Issues relating to competence give rise to significant risks for law firms. In Ontario, for example, LawPro reports that failures to know or apply the law accounted for approximately 2,703 claims and \$9.1 million in costs between 1997 and 2007.¹⁷ In 2007, the Law Society of British Columbia reported that four or more lawyers miss a limitation period or deadline each week.¹⁸ Beyond the available statistics, many additional issues of competence undoubtedly exist, resulting in poor client service although never resulting in a formal complaint to the relevant law society or a civil malpractice action.

Given the complex and dynamic nature of legal practice, continuing legal education is essential to ensure the competent delivery of legal services. In the area of ethics, the availability of informal opportunities for lawyers to discuss and deliberate on ethical issues is likely to be particularly important.¹⁹ Competence also goes beyond securing appropriate legal knowledge and skills, encompassing broader areas of concern, such as understanding of equity issues and the use of technology in practice.

Objective	Assessing compliance with this objective	Suggested systems and practices to ensure objective is met	Resources
Clients receive competent legal services	Do lawyers have appropriate and current knowledge of applicable substantive and procedural law in areas in which they practice? Do lawyers apply appropriate skills in delivering legal services? Does the law firm have appropriate resources for research to enable lawyers to access current knowledge? Do lawyers comply with applicable deadlines and limitation periods? Do lawyers and other members of the firm understand the technical and ethical aspects of using technology?	Systems are in place to ensure lawyers receive regular feedback on work product (for example, regular performance reviews are conducted; peer review, where appropriate, is encouraged). Continuing education efforts are recorded and are considered in the context of performance reviews. Lawyers prepare professional development plans that are reviewed by senior colleagues and considered in the context of performance reviews. Checklists by matter type are used where appropriate.	Guidelines for Practicing Ethically with New Information Technologies (CBA)Professional Management Practice Management Guideline (Law Society of Upper Canada)Practice Checklist Manual (Law Society of British Columbia)Checklists by fields of practice (Barreau du Québec)Legal Research Checklist (Law Society of Saskatchewan)Keeping Current (Nova Scotia Barristers' Society)Making Knowledge Management Work (CBA)

¹⁷ LawPro, "The Biggest Malpractice Risks" (online: <u>http://www.practicepro.ca/facts/malpracticerisks.asp</u>).

¹⁸ Law Society of British Columbia, "Stay tuned for more than 70 tips to prevent missed limitations and deadlines" (2007) *Benchers' Bulletin* (online: <u>http://www.lawsociety.bc.ca/page.cfm?cid=790&t=70-tips-to-prevent-missed-limitations-and-deadlines</u>).

¹⁹ See, for example, the discussion in Christine Parker et al, "The Ethical Infrastructure of Legal Practice in Larger Law Firms: Values, Policy and Behaviour" (2008) 31(1) UNSW Law Journal 158.

have adequate training in orde disabilities and	d other members of the firm awareness, knowledge and er to ensure that clients with d other equality-seeking groups tent legal services?	A system is in place for keeping lawyers up- to-date with changes in the law (for example, electronic updates are used or regular meetings are held). Guidelines for the correct steps in conducting legal research are available to lawyers. Dialogue on ethical questions is facilitated (for example, ethics "lunch and learn" seminars or "open door" policies with designated ethics counsel). All firm lawyers receive training on and use	Limitation period charts (LawPro)Time management/missed limitations (Lawyers' Insurance Association of Nova Scotia)Missed Limitations and Deadlines: Beat the Clock (Law Society of British Columbia)Saskatchewan Limitations Manual (Law Society of Saskatchewan)Technology Practice Management Guidelines (Law Society of Upper Canada)Guide des TI - Gestion et sécurité des
		bring-forward systems to keep track of key dates (for example, limitation periods, court and tribunal appearances, filing deadlines, undertakings, closing dates).	Technologies de l'information pour l'avocat et son équipe (Barreau du Québec) Respectful Language Guideline (Law Society of
		Technology training is made available and encouraged.	<u>British Columbia)</u> <u>Accessible Customer Services (Law Society of</u> <u>Upper Canada</u>)
		Ethical issues pertaining to the use of technology are raised and discussed.	<u>Upper Canada)</u> <u>Providing Legal Services to People with</u> Disabilities (ARCH Disability Law Centre)
		All members of the firm receive training on the provision of services to persons with disabilities, language rights and cultural competence.	Follow this link for more resources by fields of practice (.pdf)
		An accessibility policy is in place.	

2. <u>Client Communication</u>

Breakdowns in communication are a major source of complaints against lawyers. Client service issues, which include failures to communicate, amounted to 56% of the complaints received by the Law Society of Upper Canada in 2012.²⁰ As reported by the Lawyers' Insurance Association of Nova Scotia: "[t]he most common source of miscommunication is a simple one: lawyers routinely fail to realize how little they are actually saying - the "I'm Sure it was Obvious" effect....Nothing is ever obvious unless you made it obvious by spelling it out (preferably in writing)."²¹

Objective	Assessing compliance with this objective	Suggested systems and practices to ensure objective is met	Resources
Communication with clients is clear, continuous and courteous	Do clients and lawyers share the same understanding of terms and scope of the retainer? Do lawyers keep clients adequately informed of the status of their representation? Is client feedback actively solicited? Are client complaints adequately dealt with internally?	 Engagement letters and termination of engagement letters are used. Policies are in place that ensure systematic recording of conversations with clients (for example, policies relating to archiving email and creating notes of client meetings and phone calls). Client instructions are confirmed in writing. Clients are provided with regular progress and costs updates with a frequency and in a form that suits their needs. Clients are copied on important correspondence sent and received. Client surveys are conducted to determine satisfaction with service. Policies and procedures are in place for addressing client complaints. 	What Do You Do With Client Feedback? (CBA)Retainer Precedents (LawPro)Communication Toolkit (Law Society of British Columbia)Client Service and Communication Practice Management Guidelines (Law Society of Upper Canada)Documenting/Effective Communication (Lawyers' Insurance Association of Nova Scotia)Model Client Survey (Law Society of British Columbia)Post-matter client service survey precedent (LawPro)Follow the link for additional resources (.pdf)

²⁰ Law Society of Upper Canada, 2012 Annual Report – Performance Highlights, p. 19 (online: http://www.lsuc.on.ca/annual-report).

²¹ Lawyers' Insurance Association of Nova Scotia, "Documenting/Effective Communication" (online: http://www.lians.ca/rpm/risk_management/documenting_effective_communication).

3. <u>Confidentiality</u>

Lawyers do not always take the care required to meet their duty of confidentiality to their clients. The Law Society of British Columbia, for example, advises in its practice management materials that it "receives a number of errors and omissions claims relating to lost or missing documents" and warns "there is always a danger of sensitive documents coming into the wrong hands."²²

As technology becomes more and more integrated into lawyers' practices, ensuring the confidentiality of client information has become increasingly complex. Metadata—which can be understood as "data about data" or "information describing the history, tracking or management of an electronic document"²³—has, in particular, given rise to new ethical issues and poses unique challenges to maintaining the confidentiality of client information.

Objective	Assessing compliance with this objective	Suggested systems and practices to ensure objective is met	Resources
Client documents and communications are kept confidential in a manner consistent with lawyers' legal and ethical obligations	Do lawyers and staff understand the importance of confidentiality and applicable duties of confidentiality as provided for by rules of professional conduct and case law? Are lawyers aware of situations where disclosure of confidential information is either permissible or mandated by law? Are lawyers familiar with the requirements of privacy legislation? Is there adequate office security to ensure that confidential information— including electronic data—is secure? Are lawyers and staff aware of confidentiality issues that may arise from technologies in use at the firm?	A written confidentiality policy is in place and signed by all lawyers and staff. Lawyers and staff receive ongoing training on their duties of confidentiality. Procedures are in place for dealing with situations where exceptions to duties of confidentiality may apply. Appropriate security systems are in place with respect to physical and electronic data. Measures are taken to ensure the confidentiality of electronic communications with or about a client (for example, encryption software where appropriate, and password-protection on firm computers and lawyers' smartphones). Technology training, including training on issues of confidentiality and privacy, is made available and is encouraged.	FAQs about solicitor-client privilege and confidentiality (CBA)Guidelines for Practising Ethically with New Information Technologies (CBA)Sample confidentiality agreement (Lawyers' Insurance Association of Nova Scotia)Cloud computing due diligence guidelines (Law Society of British Columbia)"Practice Tip: Be Careful with MetaData" The Advisory, p.8 (Law Society of Alberta)Data security (Lawyers' Insurance Association of Nova Scotia)Follow the link for additional resources (.pdf)

²² The Law Society of British Columbia, Practice Material: Practice Management (February 2013) at p. 24 (online: http://www.lawsociety.bc.ca/page.cfm?cid=300).

²³ Dave Bilinsky, Practice Management Advisor, Law Society of British Columbia, "Practice Tips: Metadata" (2008) *Benchers' Bulletin* (online: <u>http://www.lawsociety.bc.ca/page.cfm?cid=461&t=Practice-Tips:-Metadata</u>).

4. Conflicts

The issue of conflicts of interest has become increasingly important over the last several decades as Canadian lawyers have become more mobile, business entities have become more complex and the courts have provided more guidance on when impermissible conflicts arise. As noted in the CBA Conflicts of Interest Toolkit, "the consequences of a conflict of interest for the lawyer can be severe and costly" and can include:

- disqualification from representation of one or more clients;
- forfeiture of fees charged and the inability to charge for work in progress and other time invested;
- a damage claim which may include punitive damages;
- embarrassment and cost in time and money of defending a malpractice claim or investigation.²⁴

In addition to monitoring for potential or actual conflicts between clients, lawyers need to also guard against conflicts between lawyers' personal interests (financial or otherwise) and client interests.

Objective	Assessing compliance with this objective	Suggested systems and practices to ensure objective is met	Resources
Impermissible conflicts of interest are avoided and, where not avoided, resolved/managed in a timely fashion	Are appropriate systems in place to identify potential and actual conflicts of interest? Do lawyers and staff understand what steps to take when a potential or actual conflict is identified?	 Policies and procedures are in place with respect to checking for and evaluating conflicts of interest: Prior to accepting a new retainer; When a new party becomes involved in a matter; Upon employment of new individuals at a firm; When a lawyer is acting for multiple parties and the interest of the parties diverge; When a lawyer is considering accepting a directorship position or engaging in a business venture with a client; and When a lawyer's interpersonal relationship (such as marriage) create possible conflicts. Systems to facilitate conflicts checks are in place (for example, appropriate databases are maintained that contain all relevant information with respect to each file). Where appropriate, a senior lawyer or committee at the firm is delegated responsibility for evaluating and addressing conflict of interest questions or situations. Lawyers and staff have been provided appropriate training regarding conflicts. Lawyers are encouraged to regularly review professional rules and case law regarding conflicts of interest. Policies are in place with respect to lawyers acting as directors for public or private companies, not-for-profit corporations or other entities. 	Conflicts of Interest – Toolkit (CBA)Model conflicts of interest checklist (Law Society of British Columbia)Checking for conflicts of interest (Law Society of Upper Canada)Conflicts of Interest Checklist (Lawyers' Insurance Association of Nova Scotia)Conflict of Interest – Lawyers' Personal Interests (Law Society of Saskatchewan)Lawyers on boards (LawPro)Sitting on a non-profit board: A risk management checklist (LawPro)Follow the link for additional resources (.pdf)

²⁴ Canadian Bar Association Conflicts of Interest – Toolkit (available online: <u>www.cba.org/cba/groups/conflicts/toolkit.aspx</u>).

5. Preservation of Client Property/Trust Accounting/File Transfers

It is imperative that law firms implement appropriate financial management systems and, in particular, that firms ensure that client money received in trust is properly handled. Fraudulent activity, both at the hands of firm members and outsider fraudsters, is an area of significant risk for law firms.²⁵ Care must also be taken to ensure that both active and closed files are properly transferred when required.

Objective	Assessing compliance with this objective	Suggested systems and practices to ensure objective is met	Resources
Client property is carefully and prudently safeguarded in a manner consistent with applicable laws and regulations	Is client property appropriately labeled and identified upon receipt? Are appropriate records kept with respect to client property? Are monies received in general accounts and trust accounts being handled properly? Is the law firm sufficiently protected from trust account misuse/fraud? Are both active and closed files transferred in a manner consistent with ethical duties?	Records are kept of client property received. An appropriate accounting system is used to track trust account funds and other monies received. Accounting records are up-to-date and accurate. Adequate internal controls are in place to minimize risk of fraud committed by firm members. Training is provided to assist law firm members in spotting possible fraudulent activity. Policies and procedures are in place regarding the transfer of active files and closed files.	 Trust account requirements and information (various law societies)²⁶ Concerning File Closure, Retention and Destruction (The Law Society of Newfoundland and Labrador) Photocopying a client's file (Law Society of the Northwest Territories) Transfer of Open Files to New Lawyer (Practice Direction) (Law Society of Manitoba) File Transfer on Termination of Retainer (Webinar) (Law Society of Saskatchewan) File Transfer (Law Society of Upper Canada) Closed files: Retention and Disposition (Law Society of British Columbia) Follow the link for additional resources (.pdf)

²⁵ Luis Millan, "The Profession's Dirty Little Secret" (March 2013) *Canadian Lawyer* (online: www.canadianlawyermag.com/4551/the-professions-dirty-littlesecret.html?print=1&tmpl=component); Yamri Taddese, "Law firm's trust account hacked, 'large six figure' taken" (January 7, 2013) *Law Times* (online: www.lawtimesnews.com/201301079535/Headline-News/Law-firms-trust-account-hacked-large-six-figure-taken).

²⁶ Trust Assurance (The Law Society of British Columbia), Trust Accounting & Safety (Law Society of Alberta), Trust Account Forms (Law Society of Saskatchewan), Articles relating to trust accounts and financial responsibility (Law Society of Manitoba), Trust accounts (Law Society of Upper Canada), Trust accounts (Lawyers' Insurance Association of Nova Scotia), Trust accounts (Law Society of Prince Edward Island).

6. <u>Fees and disbursements</u>

Dissatisfaction with fees is a major source of complaints against Canadian lawyers. Clear communication about fees and disbursements at the beginning of an engagement and throughout the duration of the engagement assists clients in making informed decisions and alleviates frustration that can occur when clients are faced with unexpected final bills. When complaints about fees do arise, firms may benefit from an internal process to help resolve disputes informally: commencing a civil action to recover fees should be undertaken with caution as the result may be a lengthy and costly counterclaim alleging negligence.²⁷ Empirical studies conducted in other jurisdictions suggest that there is lack of awareness among many lawyers as to what constitutes ethical billing practices²⁸ and have found that the existence of firm polices to ensure ethical billing is linked to lower instances of observed unethical billing.²⁹ Authors of these studies strongly recommend that firms offer clear guidance on appropriate billing practices.

Objective	Assessing compliance with this objective	Suggested systems and practices to ensure objective is met	Resources
Clients are charged fees and disbursements which are fair and reasonable and which are disclosed in a timely fashion	Are clients being charged fees that are fair and reasonable? Do lawyers have a clear understanding of what constitutes unethical billing practices? Do clients and lawyers share the same expectations regarding fees and disbursements? Is there ongoing communication with clients about fees charged and disbursements incurred?	 Written policies regarding billing practices and procedures are in place. Educative measures are in place to ensure that lawyers are aware of firm policies regarding billing practices and to encourage discussion of what constitutes unethical billing practices. At the beginning of the engagement, billing procedures and fees are discussed with clients and addressed in a written engagement letter. Where practicable, an estimate of anticipated fees and disbursements is provided and, where an estimate is given, clients are regularly updated. Firm managers periodically conduct random audits of bills. Clients are billed on a regular, interim basis. Policies and procedures are in place for internally addressing client complaints with respect to fees and disbursements. 	Model Work Guidelines for Young Lawyers (Legal Profession Assistance Conference of the CBA)Litigation Cost Estimate Template (Law Society of Upper Canada)"Practice Watch - Fees, Disbursements and Interest" Benchers' Bulletin (Law Society of British Columbia)Appropriate Billing Practices (Practice Direction (Law Society of Manitoba)Financial Management (Lawyers' Insurance Association of Nova Scotia)Resolutions to avoid fee disputes (and to make more money) (LawPro)Follow the link for additional resources (.pdf)

²⁷ Tim Lemieux, LawPro, "Resolutions to Avoid Fee Disputes (And Make More Money) (online: http://avoidaclaim.com/2013/resolutions-to-avoid-fee-disputes-and-make-more-money).

²⁸ Susan Saab Fortney, "Soul for Sale: An Empirical Study of Associate Satisfaction, Law Firm Culture and the Effects of Billable Hour Requirements" (2000) 69 UMKC Law Review 239; Christine Parker and David Ruschena, "The Pressures of Billable Hours: Lessons from a Survey of Billing Practices Inside Law Firms" (2011) 9 University of St. Thomas Law Journal 619.

²⁹ See, Parker and Ruschena, *supra* note 28 at 654, noting that their empirical study of billing practices of lawyers in Queensland, Australia revealed "a statistical relationship between firm policies to ensure ethical billing and lawyers reporting both fewer observed instances of bill padding and a lower level of ethical concern about the billing practices of other lawyers within their firms."

II. RELATIONSHIP TO STUDENTS, EMPLOYEES AND OTHERS

7. <u>Hiring</u>

Although at risk of being overlooked, hiring practices are an important part of a law firm's ethical infrastructure. Not only are lawyers "[t]he greatest asset to any law firm,"³⁰ they are also a major source of risk. Lateral hires can be particularly risky: as noted in a leading American law firm risk management text, "[t]here are multiple instances of awards and settlements in the millions of dollars because of lateral hiring decisions that turn out to have introduced 'Trojan horses' into law firms."³¹ Similar examples are likely to be found in Canada.

Hiring practices also implicate lawyers' duty to promote the public interest. There is good reason for lawyers across Canada to share in the Law Society of British Columbia's belief that "the public is best served by a more representative and inclusive legal profession that reflects the diversity of [society]."³² Unfortunately, there remains a chronic underrepresentation of individuals from equality-seeking groups in the Canadian legal profession.³³ The adoption of fair and equitable hiring practices by law firms is one measure that can be taken in an attempt to address this situation.

Objective	Assessing compliance with this objective	Suggested systems and practices to ensure objective is met	Resources
The firm engages in careful, fair and equitable hiring practices	Does the firm conduct appropriate due diligence in hiring new staff and lawyers? Does the firm engage in fair and equitable hiring practices?	Adequate due diligence is conducted on candidates before a final hiring decision is made (for example, as permitted by applicable laws, review of disciplinary records and reference and credential checks are conducted). Interviewers and lawyers who make hiring decisions receive training on gender and racial stereotypes as well the potential role of unconscious bias in hiring decisions. Written interviewing guidelines are used. An employment equity and diversity hiring policy is in place. Diversity performance within the firm is measured regularly.	CBA Equity and Diversity Guide Resource ManualCBA Measuring Diversity GuideScreening and Hiring Employees (Law Society of Upper Canada)Finders & Keepers: Recruiting and retaining top talent (LawPro)Guidelines – Recruiting, Interviewing and Hiring Practices (Law Society of British Columbia)Guidelines for Equality in Employment Interviews (Law Society of Alberta)Best Practices for Employment Interviews (Law Society of Manitoba)Summary of Fair Hiring Practices Guidelines (Law Society of Upper Canada)Follow the link for additional resources (.pdf)

³⁰ Tim Lemieux, "In the practicePRO Lending Library: Recruiting Lawyers – How to Hire the Best Talent" (March 25, 2013), online: http://avoidaclaim.com/2013/in-the-practicepro-lending-library-recruiting-lawyers-how-to-hire-the-best-talent/

³³ *Ibid.*

³¹ Anthony E. Davis and Peter R. Jarvis, *Risk Management: Survival Tools for Law Firms* (American Bar Association, 2007) at p. 135.

³² The Law Society of British Columbia, *Towards a More Representative Legal Profession: Better practices, better workplaces, better results* (June 2012) (online: http://www.lawsociety.bc.ca/docs/publications/reports/Diversity_2012.pdf).

8. Supervision/Retention/Lawyer and Staff Wellbeing

The treatment of lawyers and staff is an important aspect of risk management and ethical compliance. In 2008, LawPro reported that clerical and delegation-related errors were the sixth most common type of error by number and cost.³⁴ In the case of associate lawyers and partners, regular evaluations of performance and peer review processes can work to proactively address and remediate potential problems in lawyer competence and conduct.³⁵

Regular feedback may also assist in retention, which has significant financial implications for law firms. ³⁶ Retention is also a significant issue in relation to equality and diversity in the legal profession. This is particularly true for female lawyers. As a report by the Law Society of Upper Canada observed, "[w]omen have been entering the legal profession and private practice in record numbers for at least two decades....[but] have been leaving private practice in droves largely because the legal profession has not effectively adapted to this reality."³⁷

Ensuring that both formal and informal performance evaluation and work assignment processes are free of bias (both conscious and unconscious) is essential to alleviating systemic barriers faced by women and other members of equality-seeking groups in the legal profession.³⁸ Eliminating bias may have broader implications for risk management as well: studies on ethical behaviour in organizations suggest that the perceived fairness of procedures within an organization (like those relating to, for example, compensation, promotion and work assignments) can play an important role in fostering a culture of ethical compliance.³⁹

Finally, the wellbeing of lawyers and staff in the firm is a critical area of law firm management. It is repeatedly observed that the practice of law can be extraordinarily stressful. The consequences of this stressful environment for individuals can be devastating: rates of burnout, depression and suicide are disproportionately high in the legal profession and drug and alcohol abuse is prevalent.⁴⁰ Mental, physical and emotional issues experienced by lawyers and staff can also give rise to behaviour that leads to malpractice claims.⁴¹

Objective	Assessing compliance with this objective	Suggested systems and practices to ensure objective is met	Resources
Issues of training,	Does the firm provide initial and	Training opportunities are available to firm	Guide to Successful Associate Evaluations(CBA)Employee Delegation and Supervision(Law Society of Upper Canada)
supervision,	ongoing training for lawyers and staff?	administrators, senior lawyers, and senior staff on	
retention and	Are lawyers and staff adequately	how to train, supervise and give feedback to other	
lawyer and	supervised?	lawyers and staff.	

³⁴ The biggest malpractice risks by Dan Pinnington (LAWPRO Magazine Summer 2008) (online: http://www.practicepro.ca/LawPROmag/Pinnington_Biggest_Malpractice.pdf).

³⁵ Susan Saab Fortney, "Are Law Firm Partners Islands Unto Themselves? An Empirical Study of Law Firm Peer Review and Culture" (1996) 10 The Georgetown Journal of Legal Ethics 271.

³⁶ The Law Society of British Columbia, *Towards a More Representative Legal Profession: Better practices, better workplaces, better results* (June 2012) (online: http://www.lawsociety.bc.ca/docs/publications/reports/Diversity_2012.pdf).

³⁷ The Law Society of Upper Canada, *Executive Summary – The Retention of Women in Private Practice Working Group* (May 22, 2008) (online: http://www.lsuc.on.ca/with.aspx?id=397).

³⁸ The Law Society of British Columbia, *Towards a More Representative Legal Profession: Better practices, better workplaces, better results* (June 2012), online: http://www.lawsociety.bc.ca/docs/publications/reports/Diversity_2012.pdf

³⁹ Milton C Regan, "Moral Intuitions and Organizational Culture" (2007) 51 St. Louis U. L.J. 941.

⁴⁰ Owen Kelly, CBA PracticeLink "Coping with Stress and Avoiding Burnout: Techniques for Lawyers" (online: http://www.cba.org/cba/practicelink/bwl/stresscoping.aspx).

⁴¹ LawPro, "Wellness & Balance: Resources to Help you Find Your Footing" (online: http://www.practicepro.ca/LawPROmag/Wellness_Resources.pdf).

staff wellbeing are treated thoughtfully and seriously within the firmDo lawyers understand what work may be delegated to non-lawyers and what may not?Systems are in place to ensure that lawyers and staff receive regular feedback on work product (for example, formal performance are regularly conducted; peer review, where appropriate, is encouraged).Supervision of Employees with You (LawPro)Supervision of Employees with You (LawPro)Mare steps being taken to ensure that all lawyers and staff experience a fair and safe working environment?Systems are in place to ensure that lawyers and staff receive regular feedback on work product (for example, formal performance are regularly conducted; peer review, where appropriate, is encouraged).Supervision of Employees with You (LawPro)Human Resources/Staff Mar (Lawyers' Insurance Assoce Scotia)Personal Management Prace
Are processes for evaluation and assigning work free of bias?Appropriate innancial cransactions.Management Guideline (Li Upper Canada)Does the firm take steps to monitor and encourage lawyer and staff wellbeing?Appropriate innancial cross-actions.Model equality and harassment in the workplace.Model equality and harassment in the workplace.Model equality and harassment in the workplace.Written maternity and parental leave polices are in place.Processes in place for evaluating performance and for assigning work are reviewed for potential unconscious bias.Resource Guide for Lawyee Flexible work arrangements are available where appropriate.Model equality and diversi Upper Canada)Model policy: Itexible work arrangements are available where appropriate.Processes in place for evaluating performance and for assigning work are reviewed for potential unconscious bias.Model policy: Itexible work (Law Society of British Columbia)Hermative work arrangem to community.Lawyers are made aware of, and encouraged to use when needed or desired, personal assistance programs offered by and for the legal profession, and other mental health resources available in the community.Model policy: Itexible work (Law Society of Manitoba)Benefits are available to staff and lawyers to access good health management services (for example, exercise or courses on healthy eating, ergonomics, or stress release techniques).Model policy: On alternative (Law Society of Manitoba)Lawyer assistance program societies) ⁴³ Laughter & Law Society Columbia)Laughter & Law Society Columbia)Lawyer assistance program associations, volunteer for boards and committees,

⁴² Model policies (Law Society of British Columbia), Model equity policies (Law Society of Alberta); Equity (Law Society of Saskatchewan); Equity (Law Society of Manitoba); Equity Model Policies (Law Society of Upper Canada)

⁴³ Personal assistance programs (Law Society of British Columbia), Assist Program (Law Society of Alberta), Lawyers At Risk (Law Society of Manitoba), Member Assistance Program (Law Society of Upper Canada), Nova Scotia Lawyers Assistance Program, Yukon Lawyers Assistance Program, Lawyers' Assistance (Law Society of the Northwest Territories)

III. RELATIONSHIP TO REGULATOR, THIRD-PARTIES AND THE PUBLIC GENERALLY

9. <u>Rule of Law and the Administration of Justice</u>

The administration of justice and regulation of the profession requires that lawyers are responsive to court orders and communications from law societies. Failures to respond to law society communications or cooperate in law society investigations result in a significant number of disciplinary actions against lawyers every year. Moreover, these failures damage the reputation of the profession for trust and integrity.

Prompt and diligent compliance with undertakings is also an important part of ethical legal practice. As observed by a lawyer disciplinary panel in British Columbia:

The trust and confidence vested in lawyer's undertakings will be eroded in circumstances where a cavalier approach to the fulfillment of undertaking obligations is permitted to endure. Reliance on undertakings is fundamental to the practice of law and it follows that serious and diligent efforts to meet all undertakings will be an essential ingredient in maintaining the public credibility and trust in lawyers.⁴⁴

Opinion letters prepared by firm lawyers and relied on by third parties is another area that implicates the rule of law and proper administration of justice, in addition to raising risk management concerns. As noted in a leading American law firm risk management text, "[k]ey to managing risk in this area is the existence and enforcement of policies and procedures ensuring independent review, within the firm, before lawyers with client or matter responsibility can issue opinion letters."⁴⁵

Objective	Assessing compliance with this objective	Suggested systems and practices to ensure objective is met	Resources
Lawyers and law firms respect and foster the rule of law and the proper administration of justice	Do lawyers understand their ethical duties in relation to giving undertakings and responding to law society communications? Are steps taken to ensure undertakings, court orders, and law society requests are properly and promptly fulfilled? Does the firm provide training with respect to ethical issues that engage administration of justice issues or concerns? Does the law firm have safeguards in place regarding opinion letters that will be relied on by third parties?	 Undertakings are given in writing and the file updated when fulfilled. Where appropriate, verification is sought that an undertaking has been properly fulfilled. When given, undertakings are recorded; when fulfilled, verification is sought. Educational measures are in place to ensure that lawyers understand their ethical duties in relation to giving undertakings and responding to law society communications. Systems and policies are in place to ensure that lawyers have opportunities to discuss and understand their role in ensuring the proper administration of justice (for example, informal intra-firm education events are held and/or relevant external CPD activities are funded). Policies and procedures are in place with respect to third party opinions (for example, where appropriate, template opinion 	Undertakings (Law Society of Upper Canada)Undertakings (Lawyers' Insurance Association of Nova Scotia)Communications with the Law Society (Law Society of British Columbia)Solicitors' Legal Opinions Committee of British ColumbiaOpposing Legal Representative (Law Society of Upper Canada)

⁴⁴ As approvingly quoted by the British Columbia Court of Appeal in *The Law Society of British Columbia v. Heringa*, 2004 BCCA 97 (C.A.) at para. 10.

⁴⁵ Anthony E. Davis and Peter R. Jarvis, *Risk Management: Survival Tools for Law Firms* (American Bar Association, 2007) at p. 134.

letters are used and/or peer-review processes are in place).	
	Public Appearances and
	Statements (Law Society of
	Upper Canada)

10. Access to Justice

Lawyers have a duty to promote and protect the public interest. One of the most significant issues currently facing the Canadian public is meaningful access to justice. Canada ranked ninth among twelve European and North American countries in a 2011 World Justice Project analysis of access to civil justice.⁴⁶ Serious issues of access, such as lengthy delays, also exist in the criminal justice system. Improving access to justice in Canada requires leadership and change that reaches well beyond practices within law firms. This does not, however, preclude law firms from looking inward to what they might do themselves to better meet their obligations to promote and protect the public interest. Encouraging pro bono or other volunteer work, as well as exploring alternative fee arrangements and limited scope retainers (where appropriate and permitted under applicable laws and regulations), are examples of some tangible steps that firms can take.

Law firms should explore how their lawyers interact with self-represented parties.⁴⁷ One aspect of the access to justice crisis in Canada is that legal services have become increasingly out of reach for many Canadians. This has resulted in a large number of self-represented parties. A recent comprehensive study on self-represented litigants in Alberta, British Columbia and Ontario revealed that a significant number of self-represented litigants had complaints about the opposing counsel they dealt with.⁴⁸ On the other hand, a number of lawyers reported challenges in communicating or negotiating with self-represented litigants.⁴⁹ This suggests, at the very least, that lawyers need more information and training to assist them in dealing with self-represented litigants.

Objective	Assessing compliance with this objective	Suggested systems and practices to ensure objective is met	Resources
The law firm adopts practices that promote access to justice	Does the firm undertake practices and foster a culture in which access to justice is valued and promoted? Are lawyers trained to	Pro bono and other volunteer activity in the community is encouraged by the law firm and taken into account in performance evaluations (for example, billable hour credits are provided or annual goals are set). A written pro bono policy is in place.	Reaching Equal Justice ProjectThe ABC's of Creating a Pro Bono Policy for Your Firm(CBA)Best Practices Guide (Pro Bono Law Ontario)"Creating Pro Bono Opportunities" The Advisory (Law

⁴⁶ Mark Agrast, Juan Carlos Botero and Alejandro Ponce, WJP Rule of Law Index 2011 (Washington, D.C.: The World Justice Project, 2011) (online: <u>http://worldjusticeproject.org/publications</u>).

⁴⁷ The terms "unrepresented" or "litigant in person" are also sometimes used to describe individuals who appear in court without a lawyer. The CBA Self-Evaluation Tool follows the recent comprehensive report authored by Julie MacFarlane in using the term "self-represented litigants") (Julie MacFarlane, The National Self-Represented Litigants Project: Identifying and Meeting the Needs of Self-Represented Litigants, Final Report (May 2013) at 16 (available online: <u>http://www.representing-yourself.com/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=99&Itemid=97</u>).

⁴⁸ *Ibid.* at 91.

⁴⁹ *Ibid.* at 92.

presented parties?	Where appropriate and permitted under applicable laws and regulations, the law firm uses alternative fee arrangements and limited scope retainers (i.e. unbundled legal services). Training is provided to lawyers who are likely to encounter self-represented litigants.	Society of Alberta)Tips for Dealing with the Self-Represented Litigant (Ontario Bar Association)Self-represented Litigants: A Survival Guide (LawPro)"Unbundling" of Legal Services (Law Society of Upper Canada)
		Follow the link for additional resources (.pdf)

APPENDIX B: Additional Reading

Briton, John and Scott McLean, "Incorporated Legal Practices: Dragging the Regulation of the Legal Profession into the Modern Era" (2008) 11 Legal Ethics 241.

Chambliss, Elizabeth, "The Nirvana Fallacy in Law Firm Regulation Debate" (2005) 33(1) Fordham Urban Law Journal 101.

Chambliss, Elizabeth and David B Wilkins, "A New Framework for Law Firm Discipline" (2003) 16 Georgetown Journal of Legal Ethics 335.

Chambliss, Elizabeth and David B Wilkins, "Promoting Effective Ethical Infrastructure in Large Law Firms: A Call for Research and Reporting" (2002) 30 Hofstra Law Review 691.

Devlin, Richard F and Jocelyn Downie, "…And the Learners Shall Inherit the Earth': Continuing Professional Development, Life Long Learning and Legal Ethics Education" (2010) CLEAR 9.

Dodek, Adam, "Regulating Law Firms in Canada" (2001) 90 Canadian Bar Review 383.

Fortney, Susan and Tahlia Gordon, "Adopting Law Firm Management Systems to Survive and Thrive: A Study of the Australian Approach to Management-Based Regulation" (forthcoming)

Fortney, Susan Saab, "Are Law Firm Partners Islands Unto Themselves? An Empirical Study of Law Firm Peer Review and Culture" (1996) 10 Georgetown Journal of Legal Ethics 271

Fortney, Susan Saab, "Soul for Sale: An Empirical Study of Associate Satisfaction, Law Firm Culture and the Effects of Billable Hour Requirements" (2000) 69 UMKC Law Review 239;

Mark, Steve and Tahlia Gordon, "Compliance Auditing of Law Firms: A Technological Journey to Prevention (2009) 28:2 University of Queensland Law Journal 201

Mark, Steve "Views from an Australian Regulator" (2009) 1 Journal of the Professional Lawyer 45.

Christine Parker, "Law Firms Incorporated: How Incorporation Could and Should Make Firms More Ethically Responsible" (2004) 23 University of Queensland Law Journal 347.

Parker, Christine, Tahlia Gordon and Steve Mark, "Regulating Law Firm Ethics Management: An Empirical Assessment of an Innovation in the Regulation of the Legal Profession in New South Wales" (2010), 37:3 The Journal of Law and Society 466.

Parker, Christine, Adrian Evans, Linda Haller, Suzanne Le Mire, and Reid Mortensen, "The Ethical Infrastructure of Legal Practice in Larger Law Firms: Values, Policy and Behavior" (2008) 31 UNSW Law Journal 158.

Parker, Christine and Lyn Aitken, "The Queensland Workplace Culture Check: Learning from Reflection on Ethics inside Law Firms" (2011) 24 Georgetown Journal of Legal Ethics 399.

Parker, Christine and David Ruschena, "The Pressures of Billable Hours: Lessons from a Survey of Billing Practices Inside Law Firms" (2011) 9 University of St. Thomas Law Journal 619.

Regan, Milton, "Moral Intuitions and Organizational Culture" (2007) 51 Saint Louis University Law Journal 941.

Schneyer, Ted, "On Further Reflection: How 'Professional Self-Regulation' Should Promote Compliance with Broad Ethical Duties of Law Firm Management" (2011) 53 Arizona Law Review 577.

Schneyer, Ted, "Professional Discipline for Law Firms?" (1991) 77 Cornell Law Review 1.

Woolley, Alice, "Time for Change: Unethical Hourly Billing in the Canadian Profession and How to Fix It" (2004) 83(3) Canadian Bar Review 859.